







Subject: **MINUTES OF PRE-BID / PROPOSAL MEETING REGARDING RFP FOR PROVISION OF JANITORIAL SERVICES FOR 24 DHQ/THQ HOSPITALS OF PUNJAB**

Pre Bidding meeting was held on July 13<sup>th</sup>, 2021 at 11:30 AM in the Committee Room of Project Management Unit (PMU) under the convenorship of convener of Procurement Committee, PMU.

2. Director Outsourcing (PMU) informed the participants that Project Management Unit Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department has invited sealed bids / proposals (Technical & Financial) for the procurement of Janitorial Services for 24 DHQ/THQ Hospitals of Punjab. Scope of Services, Technical & Financial Forms and salient features of advertised RFP were briefed to the participants. The queries by the participants / prospective bidders were invited and clarified / answered. Some important decisions / clarifications against each contended point are as follows:

Querier	Bidders Queries	Decisions & Clarification
    <b>G Med (Pvt.) Ltd</b>	<p>Reference to the subject mentioned above. We have some reservations on the advertised bidding documents for the provision of janitorial services in DHQ / THQ hospitals of the Punjab. The reservations are as follows.</p> <p><b>TECHNICAL EVALUATION</b> <b>Mandatory or Prerequisite Parameters.</b></p> <p>2. In the bidding document valid registration with EOBI and PESSI is demanded. It is requested that please amend this as "Valid registration with EOBI/PESSI and Insurance" because in the prequalified firms there are some firms who have the staff insurance. After the amendment maximum prequalified firms can participate and technical qualify for this tender for a healthy competition.</p> <p><b>Sr. 3a: MANAGERIAL &amp; TECHNICAL STRENGTH</b></p> <p>It is requested that please also add the word insurance as Documentary proof of Payment of EOBI/PESSI/INSURANCE Labor. As you have already mentioned in the ITA clause 14 (page no 13) "The Service Provider shall have to provide all relevant documents required for technical qualification. Service Provider shall have to give detail of HR, Goods etc. as per enclosed Appendices. The Service Provider shall provide complete detail of relevant personnel i.e., EOBI / Insurance. Deficient documents, claims regarding HR, Supplies / equipment etc. shall not be acceptable".</p>	<p>1. Technical Evaluation, Mandatory or Prerequisite Parameters, clause 2 of RFP shall prevail.</p> <p>2. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria, Sr. # 2, Managerial &amp; Technical Strength, Approach and Methodology, sub-clause "a" of RFP shall prevail.</p> <p>3. The time period regarding submission of the Technical &amp; Financial Proposals shall not be extended due to time constraints.</p>

	Further it is requested that please extend the tender for 10-12 days so that the firms can prepare the tender properly for healthy competition. These all are our submissions for a healthy competition. We will be grateful to you in this regard.														
Console Enterprises (Pvt.) Ltd	<p>We have some concerns regarding evaluation criteria parameters:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. General Project (Services) or General Experience must not be considered for Janitorial Services Evaluation because company having requisite experience can perform better as compare to inexperienced entity. (e.g. a company which have experience in laundry or Waste management services cannot perform Janitorial Services which comprises of ERP ( HR , Biometric payroll, supply chain, Quality Department, IT department) to manage human resource for said services efficiently and effectively) as it is a renowned proverb "The work suits in the hands of the one skilled to do it".</li><li>2. Registration in ISO, SECP must be given extra marks as it is an intangible asset and the participants will be encouraged if extra marks is given.</li><li>3. In EOBI, PESSI 150 person must be mandatory in both categories with last 3 Months Contribution payment evidence as it is the lowest criteria according to your RFP but how can a firm qualify if it cannot gets even 05 marks in this parameter.</li><li>4. Last 3 Years FBR Return along with audited Statement for Financial Evaluation</li><li>5. As per wage, rate salaries must be disbursed to the Janitorial Staff with evidence.</li></ol> <p>We request you to consider our suggestions for Procurement Procedure of July 2021 for the provision of Janitorial Services in DHQ/THQ Hospitals across Punjab.</p>		<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria, Sr. # 1, General Experience and Past Performance of the Firm, sub-clause "a" of RFP shall prevail.</li><li>2. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria shall prevail.</li><li>3. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria, Sr. # 2, Managerial &amp; Technical Strength, Approach and Methodology, sub-clause "a" of RFP shall prevail.</li><li>4. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria, Sr. # 3, Financial Capability / Strength, sub-clause "a" of RFP shall prevail.</li></ol>												
Arar Innovations (Pvt.) Ltd	<table><tr><th colspan="3">RESERVATIONS IN TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA:</th></tr><tr><th>Sr. No.</th><th>Clause Reference</th><th>Reservations/Clarifications required</th></tr><tr><th colspan="3">RESERVATIONS IN EVALUTION CRITERIA</th></tr><tr><td>1.</td><td><b>TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (Clause 2):</b>  Managerial and Technical Strength</td><td>Considering the spectrum of the project, we understand that provision of Janitorial services in DHQs and THQ hospitals of Punjab requires deployment of human resource at a massive level. Therefore, it is of utmost importance to ensure that only such firms who possess the capability of providing and managing huge numbers of work-force are short listed in order to guarantee that quality of services meets the expectations. The said clause requires documentary proof of EOBI / PESSI. You would appreciate that EOBI &amp; PESSI are both statutory</td></tr></table>		RESERVATIONS IN TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA:			Sr. No.	Clause Reference	Reservations/Clarifications required	RESERVATIONS IN EVALUTION CRITERIA			1.	<b>TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (Clause 2):</b>  Managerial and Technical Strength	Considering the spectrum of the project, we understand that provision of Janitorial services in DHQs and THQ hospitals of Punjab requires deployment of human resource at a massive level. Therefore, it is of utmost importance to ensure that only such firms who possess the capability of providing and managing huge numbers of work-force are short listed in order to guarantee that quality of services meets the expectations. The said clause requires documentary proof of EOBI / PESSI. You would appreciate that EOBI & PESSI are both statutory	<ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria, Sr. # 2, Managerial &amp; Technical Strength, Approach and Methodology, sub-clause "a" of RFP shall prevail.</li><li>2. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria, Sr. # 2, Managerial &amp; Technical Strength, Approach and Methodology, sub-clause "b" of RFP shall prevail.</li><li>3. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria, Sr. # 3, Financial Capability / Strength, sub-clause "a" of RFP shall prevail.</li></ol>
RESERVATIONS IN TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA:															
Sr. No.	Clause Reference	Reservations/Clarifications required													
RESERVATIONS IN EVALUTION CRITERIA															
1.	<b>TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (Clause 2):</b>  Managerial and Technical Strength	Considering the spectrum of the project, we understand that provision of Janitorial services in DHQs and THQ hospitals of Punjab requires deployment of human resource at a massive level. Therefore, it is of utmost importance to ensure that only such firms who possess the capability of providing and managing huge numbers of work-force are short listed in order to guarantee that quality of services meets the expectations. The said clause requires documentary proof of EOBI / PESSI. You would appreciate that EOBI & PESSI are both statutory													

		<p>requirements, hence, the criteria may be amended to include documentary proof of both EOBI &amp; PESSI.</p> <p><b><u>Payment Slips of EOBI &amp; PESSI</u></b></p> <p>In addition to the verification criteria outlined in the tender documents, we request that proof of payment of at least one year's contributions by employer (i.e., participating firm) to EOBI and PESSI of claimed number of employees registered with EOBI and PESSI must be demanded in the evaluation criteria.</p> <p><b><u>Salary Disbursement Certificates</u></b></p> <p>It is further requested that the Procuring Agency must demand salary disbursement certificates duly endorsed by the respective banks for last two years. Furnishing the aforementioned certificates will corroborate the participating firms' claim with regards to persons registered on its payroll.</p> <p>Keeping in view above, it is requested to please amend the said clause.</p>	<p>4. Appendix 1 – Janitorial Supplies / Equipment of RFP shall prevail.</p> <p>5. Technical Evaluation, Evaluation Criteria, Sr. # 1, General Experience and Past Performance of the Firm, sub-clause "a" of RFP shall prevail.</p>
<p>2.</p> <p>Managerial and Technical Strength</p>	<p><b><u>TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (Clause 2):</u></b></p>	<p><b><u>Tenure of Employment:</u></b></p> <p>In the said clause the credentials of Project Manager are demanded, whereas, the tenure of the employment of Project Manager with the employer firm is not specified. Such tenure should clearly be mentioned in the evaluation criteria and the same should be fixed at a minimum of past 2 years' employment with the participating firm.</p> <p><b><u>Educational Background:</u></b></p> <p>The educational background of Project Manager is very basic, broad and lenient (i.e.; Graduation or equivalent). You would appreciate that such leniency in evaluation criteria would lead to individuals having basic BA or B.Com being qualified as Project Manager. Hence, the said clause does not justify the requirement / qualification of the managerial staff. Primarily, a project manager should be qualified in the relevant field of management sciences. The already mentioned clause gives room to firms having employed Project Managers whose educational background is not relevant to the field of Management. It is submitted that due to the nature of project and the involvement of huge stakes of Government, the required educational background must be specific to the field of project /</p>	

		<p>quality management as prior studies in management is mandatory to ensure performance / execution of the required services with full excellence.</p> <p><b><u>Salary Disbursement Certificate:</u></b></p> <p>It is hereby requested that the Procuring Agency must demand the salary disbursement certificate duly endorsed by the bank for last two years which shows the tenure of salary disbursement to that particular person. The said clause will ensure that whether the claimed persons are on the payroll of the participating firm or not.</p> <p>Keeping in view above, it is requested to please amend the said clause.</p>	
	<p>3. <b><u>TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA (Clause 3):</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Financial Strength</u></b></p> <p>Average annual turnover in last 03 years. (duly supported by Audited Financial Statements)</p> <p>&gt;=50 Million &gt;=100 Million &gt;=150 Million &gt;=200 Million &gt;=250 Million</p>	<p>Keeping in view the nature of the project and to ensure uninterrupted provision of services it is necessary that only such firms having strong financial background qualify for the subject tender.</p> <p><b><u>Annual Turnover</u></b></p> <p>The demanded financial turnover of the firm i.e. Rs. 250 Million Average for last three years does not justify the involvement of huge stakes and vast spectrum of project as described in the prequalification documents.</p> <p>The provision of Janitorial Services with the involvement of equipment and the provision of un-interrupted services requires financial soundness of the firm. The firm that has average turnover of only Rs. 250 Million in three years cannot be able to execute the uninterruptable services as demanded in the prequalification documents.</p> <p>The said clause needs to be amended and minimum Rs. 500 Million annual turnover of firm of last three years needs to be demanded in order to ensure the presence of only those firms that can ensure uninterruptable services which is can only possible with a financially sound background of participating firm.</p> <p><b><u>Income Tax Returns</u></b></p> <p>Further, to certify the credibility of participating firms, copies of submitted Income Tax Returns must also be demanded along with the existing verification documents (i.e.; Audited Financial</p>	

		Statements). The same will ensure identification of any discrepancies between the numbers reported in the Audited Financial Statements and the submitted Income Tax Returns. Keeping in view above, it is requested to please amend the said clause.	
	4. <b>Appendix 1 of Janitorial Supplies / Equipment</b>	<p>The prices of janitorial supplies / equipment mentioned in the subject tender documents are significantly lower as compared to the prices of such items specified in "FINANCIAL EVALUATION FRAMEWORK; CONTRACT FOR JANITORIAL CONSUMABLES AND OTHER ITEMS" bearing reference no. P&amp;SHD/PMU/PROC/RATES/2020-21 dated, March 24, 2021 also issued by PMU, P&amp;SHD, GOP.</p> <p>We understand that such significant differences in prices (i.e.; almost 50% or more) of the same items in two documents issued by the same procuring agency, creates disparity. Therefore, keeping in view our submission above, we request that the prices of janitorial supplies / equipment mentioned in the subject tender documents may kindly be revised to ensure that updated prices are accommodated in the subject tender documents.</p>	
<b><u>SUGGESTED CLAUSES:</u></b>			
<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>Suggested Clause</b>	<b>Grounds for Suggested Clause</b>	
1.	Performance Certificates duly endorsed by the End user.	<p>The subject services are related to the Operations and Management Services that are highly critical services and proper SOPs must be followed to perform these services, as no firm can execute the said services without having a reasonable period of experience for the performance of Operations and Management Services. This can only be ensured by the performance certificates duly endorsed by the end user / beneficiary of such services i.e.; MS/DMS of concerned hospital in case of Government Hospitals and Principal/CEO in case of Private Hospitals.</p> <p>Therefore, it must be demanded that the participating firms having satisfactory past performance certificates from healthcare facilities duly endorsed by the end users /</p>	

		beneficiaries i.e.; MS/DMS in case of Government Hospitals and Principal/CEO in case of Private Hospitals. Keeping in view above, it is requested to please add the said clause in past performance evaluation criteria.	
Super Care Service	With reference of Pre-bid meeting regarding Janitorial Services held on 13.07.2021 at 11.30 AM. In this regard, We raise the points as under: 1. We provide Janitorial services to THQ Hospital Phalia last 01 Year and Medical Superintendent furnish a performance letter two times but Procuring Agency advertise the THQ Phalia in upcoming RFPs held on 16 <sup>th</sup> July, 2021. So it is therefore requested to please reevaluate the matter on merit basis and consider our request for extension THQ Hospital Phalia for next Financial Year. 2. Secondly we also raise the important issue regarding supplies rate designed by Procuring Agency that is very cheap because these rates are implemented since 2017 to till date. During this tenure the inflation rate has been increased. So please it is therefore requested please revise/increase the current supplies rate according to present market situation. 3. Third The Provincial Government announced in current Budget the wage of unskilled labour Rs.20,000/-. In this regard please clarify the preparation of Financial bid according to Rs.20,000/- or Rs. 17,500.		1. Operational Issue not related to current procurement process.  2. Appendix 1 – Janitorial Supplies / Equipment of RFP shall prevail.  3. Already incorporated in RFP under Financial Evaluation, Financial Proposal Form 3 and Appendix-5 PPRA Circular.

3. The Pre- Bid / proposal minutes / decisions will be construed as part of the bidding document.

  
Project Officer (Outsourcing)

  
Project Manager Outsourcing

  
Project Manager (A&A)

  
Senior Project Manager (A&A)

  
Procurement Specialist

  
Director Operations

  
Director Outsourcing

  
Deputy Project Director

Approved By:

  
Project Director