



Dated Lahore, the February 03rd, 2021

SUBJECT: **MINUTES OF MEETING OF GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE FOR THE REDRESSAL OF GRIEVANCES OF APPLICANTS AGAINST THE RFP FOR PROVISION OF MEPG SERVICES FOR DHQ / THQ HOSPITALS OF THE PUNJAB**

Meeting of Grievance Redressal Committee was held on February 02nd, 2021 at 05:00 pm in the Committee Room of Project Management Unit (PMU), 31-E1, Gulberg III, Shahrah-e-Imam Hussain, Lahore under the convener ship of Project Director, PMU. The attendance of the subject meeting is attached at **Annex-A**.

Project Management Unit Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department invited sealed proposals (Technical & Financial) against the Request for Proposal (RFP) for the “**Provision of MEPG Services for DHQ / THQ hospitals of the Punjab**”. Consequently, 04 applicants submitted their proposals for the subject Request for Proposal (RFP) which were received and opened on 14-01-2021. Notified Procurement Committee evaluated the Technical Proposals in accordance with Rule No. 32 of Punjab Procurement Rules, 2014. As per Technical Proposal Evaluation Report, out of 04 applicants, 03 firms were declared Technically Responsive. The Technical Proposals Evaluation Report was uploaded on official website of PMU & P&SHD. The signed Technical Proposals Evaluation Report is attached at **Annex-B**.

Foregoing in view, Project Management Unit (PMU) received the grievances from the applicants against the Technical Proposal Evaluation Report of the subject RFP. The grievances of the applicants are attached at **Annex-C**. The Grievance Committee after examination of grievances, scrutiny of record, hearing the representative of each aggrieved applicant / firm and due deliberation and discussion, decided upon the grievances of the bidders. The detail of the grievances, deliberations & decisions of Grievance Redressal Committee is given below.

Sr. #	Name of the aggrieved Applicant	Description
1.	<p align="center">M/s Mod Mech Engineering Services (Original Letter(s) Attached)</p>	<p>This is with reference of your e-mail dated 22nd January 2021 regarding the technical evaluation of tender reference no: P&SHD/PMU/OS/MEPG-02/2021 and pre-qualified applicants vide notification no. PMU/P&SHD/OS/715 dated November 19, 2020. Furthermore to reply inline of your email. We have participated in the tender for provision of Mechanical, Electrical, Plumbing and Generator operation and maintenance services of DHQ/THQ Hospital of the Punjab. After evaluation, PMU published our technical bid nonresponsive.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Relevant Projects against Sr. No. 1a. MOD Grievance: We are one of the leading service provider to serval industries in Pakistan. One of our customer is very reputed company in Pakistan named Mobiserve Pakistaan Pvt Ltd. Since Mobiserve Pakistan is a multinational company and their measuring standards are very high and we have provided services to them up to their mark. The required supporting documents of the firm experience are submitted in our grievance letter. (Contracts verified on stamp paper by our customers, payment proofs) kindly review our documents and grant us the marks we deserved as per our firm experience. 2. Approach and Methodology against Sr. No. 1b. MOD Grievance: there was not any slab for approach and mythology evaluation as mentioned in other technical evaluation criteria, so review our submitted documents and give us full marks. 3. 3. Supervisor /in charge against Sr.No.2a MOD Grievance: we have attached further documents (CNIC Cards, PEC cards) for your review. All of our staff can be verified by PMU at any time. We have 26 BSC engineers 18 with PEC registration number. To obtain maximum marks we only require 16 BSC engineers. 4. Carpenter against Sr.No.2e. MOD Grievance: we have attached further documents (CNIC Cards, Appointment letters, and salary sheets) for your further review and needful action. 5. Mobile workshop against Sr.No.3h. MOD Grievance: we have attached further documents (agreement) copy on stamp paper, pictures of all 5 workshops, pictures of tools, vehicle registration for your review.

		<p>6. Backup Generators against Sr.No.3g.</p> <p>MOD grievance: we have attached further documents (agreements on the stamp paper, summary for 10 backup generators, pictures of the generators) for your review. Furthermore that we are a very experienced company and worked very hard to come one of the leading company in Pakistan. We have served to multinationals companies and we comply with high standards SOPS. We started this company as a service provider in 2007 but we have vast experiences in several businesses.</p> <p>We are very close to passing marks criteria and we request you to please re-consider our technical offer and give us a chance to serve your esteemed organization and healthier competition to get the competitive rates with our quality services. Kindly review again our file and give us the marks our company deserves.</p> <p>We hope that you will pay your attention on this matter for the healthy competition between companies.</p>
<p>Deliberation & Decision of the Grievance Redressal Committee</p>		<p>The Grievance Redressal Committee heard the stance pleaded by the firm and verified the record submitted by M/s Mod Mech Engineer Services.</p> <p>The Grievance Redressal Committee took this matter considerately and examined the documents submitted by M/s Mod Mech Engineer Services. After thorough examination of the record the Grievance Redressal Committee observed following below mentioned points.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The representative of M/s Mod Mech Engineer Services was asked to submit the payment record of work order regarding Poly Clinic Hospital by 03-02-2021 till 12.00 pm. M/s Mod Mech Engineering Services did not submit the requisite record. Further the contract signed with Mobiserve Pakistan Pvt Ltd. is not considered being improper in aspect of codal and legal formalities. 2. The Grievance Redressal Committee reviewed the decision of Procurement Committee alongwith the submitted Proposal and documents submitted by M/s Mod Mech Engineer Services. The marks allotted in Approach and Methodology Section was as per submitted document because it lacks proper detail as required in Technical Evaluation Criteria. 3. The documents regarding Technical Strength of Team was reviewed by Grievance Redressal Committee and it was unanimously decided that marks allotted under the Technical Strength of Team section in Technical Proposal Evaluation Report was adequate and as per submitted documents. 4. The marks regarding Mobile Workshop and Backup Generators were given 8 and 8 respectively. The Grievance Redressal Committee reviewed the submitted Proposal

and documents submitted by M/s Mod Mech Engineer Services and it was unanimously decided that the marks allotted to M/s Mod Mech Engineering Services was adequate as per submitted documents.

Hence, the Grievance of M/s Mod Mech Engineering Services is rejected and applicant remained Non-Responsive for the Provision of MEPG Services in DHQ/THQ Hospitals of the Punjab.