



SUBJECT: MINUTES OF MEETING OF GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE FOR THE REDRESSAL OF GRIEVANCES OF APPLICANTS AGAINST THE “PREQUALIFICATION FOR PROVISION OF JANITORIAL SERVICES”

Meeting of Grievance Redressal Committee was held on November 25th, 2020 at 03:00 pm in the Development Wing of Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department, 15 Birdwood Road, Lahore under the convener ship of Project Director, PMU. The attendance of the subject meeting is attached at **Annex-A**.

2. Project Management Unit, Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department invited applications for the Prequalification for Provision of Janitorial Services. Consequently, **35 applicants** submitted their applications / proposals, which were received and opened on 22-09-2020. The notified Procurement Committee, after evaluating each Prequalification Application in accordance with Rule 32 of PPR-2014 and thorough deliberation finalized the Prequalification Applications Evaluation Report. As per Prequalification Applications Evaluation Report, out of 35 applicants **24** were declared as Prequalified. The Prequalification Applications Evaluation Report was uploaded on official website of Project Management Unit (PMU) and Primary & Secondary Healthcare Department. The signed Prequalification Applications Evaluation Report is attached at **Annex-B**.

3. Foregoing in view, Project Management Unit (PMU) received the grievances from the applicants against the aforementioned Prequalification Applications Evaluation Report. The grievances of the applicants are attached at **Annex-C**. The Grievance Committee after examination of grievances, scrutiny of record, hearing the representative of each aggrieved applicant and after due deliberation and discussion, decided upon the grievances of the applicants. The detail of the grievances, deliberations & decisions of Grievance Redressal Committee is tabulated below.


Name of the aggrieved Applicant	Description
<p>1. M/s NADEEM CLEANING SERVICES</p> <p>Subject: Grievances against prequalification of firm for Janitorial Services DHQ/THQ Hospitals in the Punjab.</p> <p>DATED: 18-11-2020 (Original Letter(s) Attached)</p>	<p>It is submitted that this company participated in prequalification of firm for janitorial services in DHQ/THQ hospitals in Punjab. We submitted the audit report which has not been included while awarding marks.</p> <p>Now we are resubmitting the audit report and requesting you recheck and award marks accordingly I, will highly appreciate your this favorable action please.</p>
<p>Deliberation & Decision of the Grievance Redressal Committee</p>	<p>The Grievance Redressal Committee heard the stance pleaded by the firm and verified the record submitted by M/s Nadeem Cleaning Services.</p> <p>The Grievance Redressal Committee took this matter considerably and examined the documents submitted by M/s Nadeem Cleaning Services. After thorough examination of the record the Grievance Redressal Committee observed following below mentioned points.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. The applicant was registered in July 2018 and is not registered in sales tax with FBR. ii. In original application no audit report of M/s Nadeem Cleaning Services was provided instead audit report of Watch & Watch Guard was attached. iii. The instant submission of Audited Financial Statements is for two years only and only Report to Management was provided instead of Audit Report to Members. iv. The Financial Statements are not signed by the Management of the Company and 2018 Financial Report issuing date is of Sunday. <p>Hence, the Grievance of M/s Nadeem Cleaning Services is rejected and applicant remained Non-Responsive for the Prequalification for the Provision of Janitorial Services. The Revised Prequalification Applications Evaluation Report is attached at Annex-D.</p>
<p>2. M/s AA DEVELOPERS</p> <p>AA/PQ/PMU/11.20</p> <p>DATED: 16-11-2020</p> <p>(Original Letter(s) Attached)</p>	<p>With reference to prequalification document reference no. P&SHD/PMU/PQ/OS/2020 regarding janitorial services. In this connection, we file grievance against your evaluation because of not proper issuance of marks in following bid segment.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Experience 2. PESSI and EOBI 3. Project manager experience

	<p>1. EXPERIENCE In experience segment evaluation committee issue us 18 marks but on other hand we file 9 relevant projects according to bidding document 3 marks for each relevant project. (copy of agreements attached). So it is therefore requested to please recheck our experience segment again.</p> <p>2. PESSI In PESSI segment we file 110 nos. of personnel payment challan slips but evaluation committee issue us 0 marks. so it is therefore requested to please recheck our PESSI slips (copy attached)</p> <p>3. PROJECT MANAGER EXPERIENCE In this segment, we file 06 nos. project manager CVs but committee issue us 2.5 marks so please recheck again this segment also. (CVs attached)</p> <p>submitted for your kind information and requested to please re-evaluate our bid on merit</p>
<p>Deliberation & Decision of the Grievance Redressal Committee</p>	<p>The Grievance Redressal Committee heard the stance pleaded by the firm and verified the record submitted by M/s AA Developers.</p> <p>The Grievance Redressal Committee took this matter considerately and examined the documents submitted by M/s AA Developers. After thorough examination of the record the Grievance Redressal Committee observed following below mentioned points.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. The marks in General Experience and the Past Performance of the Firm increased to 27. ii. 5 marks in Documentary Proof of insurance / EOBI / PESSI have been awarded. iii. The marks in CVs of Project Managers increased to 4 after accepting documents. <p>Hence, the Grievance of M/s AA Developers is accepted and the Revised Prequalification Applications Evaluation Report is attached at Annex-D.</p>


Legal Expert
 Procurement Cell, P&SHD


Assistant Director (A&A)
 Development Wing, P&SHD


Director ICT
 PMU, P&SHD


Director (Headquarter), Office of
DGHS, P&SHD


Project Director
 PMU, P&SHD

REVISED PREQUALIFICATION APPLICATIONS EVALUATION REPORT BY GRIEVANCE REDRESSAL COMMITTEE
PREQUALIFICATION FOR PROVISION OF JANITORIAL SERVICES
REFERENCE. NO. P&SHD/PMU/PQ/OS/2020
Applications Opening Date: 22-09-2020

Mandatory Requirements		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32	33	34	35	
		SUPER CARE SERVICE	G-MED LTD	ADANI KIANI ENTERPRISES (PVT) LTD	ARAR INNOVATIONS (PVT) LTD	STARK INDUSTRIAL SOLUTIONS (PVT) LTD	HADEE H CLEANING SERVICES (PVT) LTD	FAZ BROTHERS	CAIDS MARKETING NETWORK (PVT) LTD	THE MAINTAINERS	M.MAQ SOOD & CO.	AA DEVELOPERS	HELOU TECH JANITORIAL SERVICES (PVT) LTD	SARMIK (PVT) LTD	CONSOLE ENTERPRISES (PVT) LTD	BABAR AND UMAR (PVT) LTD	INDUS ENGINEERING	ANAS BROTHERS ENTERPRISES (PVT) LTD	SB CLEANING SERVICES (PVT) LTD	NATIONAL CLEANING SERVICES	SMART CLEANING SERVICES (PVT) LTD	IRFAN & COMPANY	MUSTAHLK ENTERPRISES JV NEOTEC SERVICES (PVT) LTD	ALI BROTHERS & CO.	NASSR MAHMOOD & CO.	GHULAM FARD & BROTHERS (PVT) LTD	MASTEK CLEAN SERVICES	BILAL ENTERPRISES	BEST MANSOUL SERVICES (PVT) LTD	AN MANOJ & SERVICES	RZ ENTERPRISES	AL-HUSSAINI & COMPANY (PVT) LTD	CDY SERVICES	TRENADOR INTERNATIONAL (PVT) LTD	WASTE BUSTERS JV MBM SERVICES	HADI BROTHERS & CO.	
1	An Applicant shall be a legally registered entity with the formal intent to enter into an agreement or under an existing agreement.	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply
2	The applicant must be an active tax payer on or before the submission of Prequalification Application.	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	
3	The applicant must have National Tax Number (NTN) & General Sales Tax Number with documentary proof shall have to be provided by applicant(s) alongwith PST, PRA, etc if applicable.	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	
4	The Applicant shall have a valid registration with EOBI / PESSI.	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	
5	Applicant(s) who is barred / blacklisted or disqualified either by any Government / Department / Agency / Authority would not be eligible to submit the Application. The Applicant will submit an undertaking in this regard.	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	
6	Consortium / Association / Joint Venture	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	
7	The copy of the Prequalification Documents duly signed and stamped by the applicant shall be attached with the EOBI / Prequalification Application.	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	
Comply / Not Comply		Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	Comply	
TECHNICAL EVALUATION CRITERIA FOR PREQUALIFICATION OF JANITORIAL SERVICES																																					
SECP Registration and ISO / Relevant Certification																																					
Sl. No.	PARAMETER	MAXIMUM SCORE	0	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	
1	a. SECP Registration (05 Marks)	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5		
	b. ISO / Relevant Certification (05 Marks)	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	
TOTAL SECP Registration and ISO / Relevant Certification			5	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	
General Experience and Past Performance of the Firm																																					
2	a. Each General Project will be given 02 Marks Each Relevant Project will be given 03 Marks Relevant Project means that the service provider is providing services to public / private sector w.r.t. relevance of Janitorial services. Each Institution/ Organization/ Hospital will be consider as an independent project. In order to evaluate general projects it is mandatory that only services rendered in Public sector would be considered. Only those Project(s) will be considered for evaluation whose contract agreement value will be 10 Million or more for both general & relevant projects. The Applicant shall have to provide Completion Certificate / Satisfactory Performance Certificate / Purchase Order/ Contract / Payment Record. If a service provider is providing service from 01 year it will be consider as one project and for two years it will be consider as 2 projects and so. The Applicant shall have to provide documentary proof of services in public / private sector, in order to substantiate its claim.	30	30	27	23	30	30	9	30	30	3	30	27	30	24	30	30	30	30	21	30	0	6	12	12	21	26	18	30	30	0	30	30	15	6	30	3
Managerial Capability / Technical Strength of the Firm (Approach and Methodology)																																					
3	a. Documentary proof of Insurance/EOBI/PESSI from 100-149 No. of Janitorial Staff (05 Marks) Documentary proof of Insurance/EOBI/PESSI from 150-199 No. of Janitorial Staff (10 Marks) Documentary proof of Insurance/EOBI/PESSI from 200-249 No. of Janitorial Staff (15 Marks) Documentary proof of Insurance/EOBI/PESSI from 250-300 No. of Janitorial Staff (20 Marks)	30	20	0	20	20	15	0	20	0	0	5	20	0	10	5	15	20	20	20	0	5	10	0	15	20	0	5	10	0	20	20	0	15	15	0	
	b. Project Manager having requisite experience. 03 Project Managers / Incharge (2.5 Marks) 06 Project Managers / Incharge (05 Marks)	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	2.5	4	2.5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	2.5	5	0	2.5	2.5	0	5	2.5	0	5	5	5	5	2.5	5	0
	c. Approach and Methodology (05 Marks)	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	0	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
TOTAL Managerial Capability / Technical Strength of the Firm			30	10	30	30	30	25	10	30	5	7.5	14	27.5	10	20	15	25	30	30	30	5	12.5	20	5	22.5	27.5	5	15	17.5	0	30	30	10	22.5	25	5
Financial Capability/Strength																																					
4	a. Cumulative Annual Turnover for last 03 Years. (Duly supported by Audited Financial Statements)	25	25	15	0	25	25	0	25	25	0	25	25	25	25	25	5	15	25	25	0	10	25	0	25	25	0	20	15	0	10	25	20	25	25	0	
	b. Financial Ratio																																				
	Current Ratio	2	1.5	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
	Debt Equity Ratio	1.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	0	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	0.5	2.5	0.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3.5	3	0	3.5	2	3.5	3.5	3.5	
	Working Capital Ratio	1.5	1.5	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
TOTAL Financial Capability/Strength			28.5	18.5	3.5	28.5	28.5	0	28.5	28.5	3.5	28.5	28.5	25.5	27.5	25.5	28.5	8.5	18.5	28.5	28.5	0	13.5	26.5	3.5	28.5	28.5	3.5	23.5	18	0	13.5	27	23.5	28.5	28.5	3.5
TOTAL MARKS (OUT OF 100)		100	93.5	65.5	66.5	98.5	98.5	44	73.5	93.5	16.5	71	69.5	93	66.5	85.5	83.5	68.5	88.5	89.5	93.5	15	37	68.5	25.5	72	87	31.5	73.5	75.5	0	73.5	87	53.5	67	88.5	16.5
FINAL REMARKS			RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	RESPON SIVE	NON-RESPON SIVE	


 Legal Expert Procurement Cell, P&SHD


 Assistant Director (A&A) Development Wing, P&SHD


 Director ICT PMU, P&SHD


 Director (Headquarter), Office of DGHS, P&SHD


 Project Director PMU, P&SHD